Page 1 of 6

ORDER SHEET WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal

& The Hon'ble P. Ramesh Kumar.

Case No -<u>OA-880 of 2016.</u>

	Naru Gopal Das. – Vs- The State of West Bengal & Others.	
Serial No. and Date of order.	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
<u> </u>	For the Applicant : Mr. Soumendra Narayan Ray, Advocate.	
	For the Respondents : Mr. Goutam Pathak Banerjee, Advocate.	
	As prayed for leave granted to Mr. Goutam	
	Pathak Banerjee, learned advocate for the respondents	
	to paginate the written reply filed.	
	In this application, Naru Gopal Das, the	
	applicant, has prayed for several reliefs, the relevant	
	portion of which is as under :	
	"(A) A direction to issue upon the	
	concerned respondent authorities to	
	forthwith supply the information that	
	were sought for by the	
	petitioner/applicant in the Second appeal	
	filed before the respondent no.4 dated 4 th	
	January, 2016 which was received by the	
	said authority on 4^{th} January, 2016, to	
	the petitioner/applicant""	
	Mr. Soumendra Narayan Ray, learned advocate	
	for the applicant referring to the order dated 29 th	
	November, 2018 submits that in spite of the order	

Naru Gopal Das.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessar 3
	dated 6th May, 2016 passed in W. P. 6623 (W) of 2016	
	(Naru Gopal Das Vs. The State of West Bengal & Ors.)	
	wherein it was held that "It is indeed true that neither	
	the marks nor evaluation sheets/score sheets have	
	been supplied. However, such issue cannot be	
	examined in course of this writ petition," evaluation	
	sheets/score sheets are yet to supplied. Though by	
	order dated 29th November, 2018 directions were	
	issued upon the Director General, Department of Fire	
	& Emergency Services, Government of West Bengal to	
	furnish a copy of the report vide no. WBFES/581/18	
	dated 1 st February, 2018 it not been produced.	
	Mr. Goutam Pathak Banerjee, learned advocate	
	appearing on behalf of the State submits that since the	
	Tribunal earlier was not properly assisted he has been	
	requested by the authorities to assist the Court in this	
	matter and for the first time he is appearing in this	
	matter. Submission is as the Tribunal was not properly	
	assisted the order on 29 th November, 2018 was passed.	
	Referring to the written reply, verified by the Director-	
	in- Charge, Fire & Emergency Services, Government of	
	West Bengal, filed by the State, particularly pages-24,	
	25 and 26 thereof it is submitted that all information	

Naru Gopal Das.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA-880 c</u>	<u>)1 2010.</u>	
Serial No. and Date of order.	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature
1		of parties when necessary 3
	have been provided. Submission is that pursuant to	
	the order of the Supreme Court dated 20th January,	
	2012 the respondents had conducted the test on 24th	
	February, 2012. The applicant had appeared and	
	participated in the selection process. Subsequently the	
	applicant had filed another petition before the	
	Supreme Court which was dismissed on 3rd January,	
	2013 as evident from page-53 of the reply.	
	In reply it is submitted by Mr. Soumendra	
	Narayan Ray, learned advocate for the applicant that	
	since the selection process is of 1996, those records and	
	the original reports should have been produced.	
	Heard learned advocates for the parties. It	
	appears that the applicant has filed Special Leave	
	Petition before the Supreme Court which was	
	disposed of on 20th January, 2012 by passing the	
	following order :	
	"Having heard learned	
	counsel for the parties, we are of the	
	opinion that the ends of justice would be	
	served if the direction contained in the	
	impugned order, dated 30 th January,	
	2008, passed in WPST NO. 579 of 2006	

Case No. <u>OA-880 of 2016.</u>

Naru Gopal Das.

Vs.

....

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA-880 of 2016.</u>		
Serial No. and Date of order.	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
	is given effect to even at this stage.	
	Accordingly, we direct the Director	
	General, West Bengal Fire Services, to	
	call the petitioners for viva voce test,	
	within four weeks of the receipt of a	
	copy of this order. After their	
	assessment in the viva voce test, the	
	final result shall be compiled by taking	
	into consideration the written and	
	endurance tests already undergone by	
	them. If on the basis of their overall	
	performance, the petitioners are found	
	to be eligible for appointment to the post	
	of Sub-Officer in the Fire Services	
	Department they shall be given	
	appointment forthwith, relaxing the age	
	bar, if any. Insofar their seniority is	
	concerned, they shall be placed	
	immediately below the Sub-Officers,	
	who were selected pursuant to the	
	advertisement issued some time in the	
	year, 1995. However, we clarify that the	
	petitioners shall not be entitled to any	
	back wages for the period they have not	
	buck wages for the period they have not	

Form No.

Case No. OA-880 of 2016.

Naru Gopal Das.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA-880</u>		est Dengar & OTS.
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	worked.	
	The special leave petition stands	
	disposed of in above terms"	
	It appears that the applicant had participated in	
	the selection process as evident from pages -24, 25 and	
	26 of the reply.	
	We have gone through the information sought for	
	from pages-43 and 44 of the application. The answers	
	are at pages 24 to 26 of the reply. It is also reveals that	
	Director General, West Bengal Fire & Emergency	
	Services was the Chairman and Joint Secretary, Deptt.	
	Of Fire & Emergency Services, Director, West Bengal	
	Fire & Emergency Services and Deputy Director (FP),	
	West Bengal Fire & Emergency Services were the	
	members of the Board.	
	The submission of Mr. Ray, for producing the	
	records of the selection process of 1995 cannot be	
	granted as pursuant to the direction of the Supreme	
	Court the applicant has participated in the selection	
	process on 24th February, 2012, as evident from the	
	signature in the attendance register annexed to the	
	reply. Now he cannot turn back seek the records of	
	1995. On a query Mr. Goutam Pathak Banerjee submits	

Naru Gopal Das.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA-880 o</u>	<u>of 2016.</u>	
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	on instruction that Mr. Durgapada Tarania was the	
	Chairman and Sk. Ahmed, Joint Secretary, Mr. Gopal	
	Bhattacharya, Director and Mr. Asit Kumar Sarkar,	
	Deputy Director were the members of the Board.	
	So far as the prayer of the applicant for having	
	copy of the report as directed by the order dated 29th	
	November, 2018 is concerned, we are of the view that	
	had the Tribunal been properly assisted, we would not	
	have passed the said order. Hence no order is passed	
	on this application. The application is disposed of.	
	(P. RAMESH KUMAR) (SOUMITRA PAL) MEMBER (A) CHAIRMAN	
Sourav.		